

Online Appendix:

Careless Whisper: Political Elite Discourses Activate National Identities for Far-Right Voting Preferences

Antonia C. May (GESIS Leibniz Institute for the Social Sciences, Cologne, Germany)
Christian S. Czymara (Tel-Aviv University, Tel-Aviv, Israel & Goethe University Frankfurt, Germany)

All code is freely accessible at <https://www.doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/NTEXG>.

Part I: Overview of micro-level datasets

We primarily use the harmonization syntax provided by the ONBound project that harmonizes micro- and macro-level sources related to national and religious identities. To include religiosity and union membership, we used the ONBound infrastructure and added syntax that harmonizes church attendance and union membership.

Table A1. Size of analysed country-year samples (after list-wise deletion of missing values of included variables).

	1993	1995	1996	2003	2004	2005	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2017	2018	2020
Austria		948			904		1,428								1,519	
Bulgaria			1,046				1,424							1,400		
Croatia							1,298			944			991	1,380		
Czech Republic		616		1,043			1,535					1,716		1,407		
Denmark					1,188		1,425			1,233				3,055		
Estonia							1,244			771					1,136	
Finland				1,156				1,006		1,120				1,124		
France				736			1,421				1,801				1,757	
Georgia							1,467				1,476				2,160	
Germany		1,714			1,166		1,911						1,594	1,867		
Hungary		965		915			1,407		925						1,441	

Iceland					724		951	1,526	
Ireland		947	775	460					
Italy	384				1,412				2,171
Latvia				1,193			818		
Lithuania				1,419		1,149			1,397
Netherlands		1,828	1,535	1,43				2,249	
Norway		1,263	1,299	959			1,359		1,004
Poland	1,414			1,267	1,416			1,293	
Portugal			1,205	1,444		945			1,115
Slovakia		1,347	888	1,346			1,110	1,372	
Slovenia			966	1,296		970		1,006	
Spain		1,069	1,046	1,356		860		1,112	
Sweden		1,129	1,018		968	962		1,091	
Switzerland			909	989		995	1,007	2,583	
United Kingdom		924	696		1,592		777		1,615

Part II: Results & Robustness Checks

Table A2. Fixed effects models on far-right voting

	M1	M2	M3
<i>Individual level</i>			
National Identity (Reference=Others, 0)			
Exclusionists	0.038*** (0.007)	0.039*** (0.006)	0.039*** (0.006)
Age			0.002*** (0.000)
Age ²			-0.000*** (0.000)
Education (Reference=No formal education,0)			
Primary education			0.005 (0.007)
Lower secondary education			0.014 (0.008)
Upper secondary education			0.015* (0.007)
Post-secondary, non-tertiary education			0.011 (0.009)
Tertiary education			-0.009 (0.008)
Gender (Reference=Female,0)			
Male			-0.022*** (0.003)
Union Membership (Reference=No member,0)			
Currently member			0.013*** (0.003)
Church Attendance (Ref.=Once/several times a week,1)			
One to three times a month			-0.012 (0.007)
Several times a year, only on special holidays			-0.010 (0.007)
Once a year or less frequently			0.000 (0.008)
Never, practically never			-0.006 (0.009)
<i>Country level</i>			
Political elite discourse	0.048*** (0.009)	0.036*** (0.007)	0.036*** (0.007)
Immigration		0.001 (0.007)	0.001 (0.007)
GDP		0.004*** (0.001)	0.005*** (0.001)
Unemployment		-0.002 (0.002)	-0.002 (0.002)
Constant	0.047*** (0.004)	-0.116* (0.046)	-0.150** (0.050)
Observations	127409	127409	127409
R2	0.106	0.112	0.117
AIC	-3122.48	-4063.52	-4700.88
BIC	-3093.22	-4004.99	-4515.53

Note: Standard errors in parentheses; * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$. Model M1 includes main predictors, Model M2 additionally includes country-level controls, and Model M3 includes both micro- and macro-level controls.

Table A3. Interaction effect models on far-right voting

	Main Inter- action Model	RC 1: Without Hungary	RC 2: Un- weighted	RC 4a: Inclus. discourse only	RC 4a: Salience	R5: Alter- native Dis-course Measure (IPM)	RC 6: Logistic Model (Odds- Ratios)	RC 7: Alter- native Outcome, ParlGov
Political elite discourse								
Exclus. discourse	0.005 (0.031)	0.009 (0.029)	-0.008 (0.011)			-0.007 (0.013)	0.902 (0.419)	0.019 (0.026)
Inclus. discourse				-0.054*** (0.013)				
Salience					-0.031 (0.042)			
National Identity (Exclusionists)	0.030 (0.019)	0.027 (0.017)	0.038 (0.020)	0.056* (0.026)	0.029 (0.018)	0.008 (0.017)	1.350 (0.272)	0.038 (0.021)
Interaction National Identity x Political elite discourse								
Exclus. discourse	0.022*** (0.005)	0.030** (0.009)	0.022** (0.007)			0.022** (0.007)	1.071** (0.027)	0.009** (0.003)
Inclus. discourse				0.004 (0.006)				
Salience					0.023*** (0.006)			
Country-level controls	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Individual-level controls	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Constant	-0.186* (0.081)	-0.124 (0.067)	-0.183 (0.079)	-0.369*** (0.077)	-0.220** (0.082)	-0.036 (0.119)	0.000*** (0.000)	-0.085 (0.066)
Observations	127409	121756	127409	127409	127409	43293	100795	127409
R ²	0.133	0.095	0.133	0.127	0.132	0.070	0.174	0.066
Pseudo R								
AIC	-6871.01	-22967.6	-6839.61	-6015.4	-6816.14	-8570.39	49252.8	-67918.3
BIC	-6041.82	-22171.4	-6000.67	-5186.21	-5986.95	-8275.41	49919.2	-67089.1

Note: Standard errors in parentheses; * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$; RC1-RC7 are robustness checks. Numbers refer to the respective paragraph in the manuscript.

Table A4. Average marginal effects of the Main Interaction Model (Identity at Discourse)

	dy/dx	95% confidence interval	
National Identity (Reference=Others, 0)			
National Identity (Exclusionists)			
at Political elite discourse = -.957 (min)	0.014* (0.006)	0.002	0.026
at Political elite discourse = 5.218 (max)	0.151*** (0.027)	0.097	0.204

Note: Standard errors in parentheses; * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$; Differences of National Identity at minimum and maximum of Political Elite Discourse

Table A5. Average marginal effects of the Main Interaction Model (Discourse Effects)

	dy/dx	95% confidence interval	
Political elite discourse at National Identity (Others)	0.029*** (0.008)	0.014	0.045
at National Identity (Exclusionists)	0.051*** (0.009)	0.033	0.070

Note: Standard errors in parentheses; * p < 0.05, ** p < 0.01, *** p < 0.001; Discourse Effects for Exclusionists versus Other National Identity Types

Table A6: Fixed-Effects Models of Robustness Checks (RC1-RC7)

	Main Inter- action Model	RC 1: Without Hungary	RC 2: Un- weighted	RC 4a: Inclus. discourse only	RC 4a: Salience	R5: Alter-native Dis-course Measure (IPM)	RC 6: Logistic Model (Odds- Ratios)	RC 7: Alter- native Outcome, ParlGov
Political elite discourse								
Exclus. discourse	0.036*** (0.007)	0.039*** (0.010)				0.010 (0.008)	1.023 (0.067)	0.010*** (0.002)
Inclus. discourse				-0.001 (0.005)				
Salience					0.036*** (0.008)			
National Identity (Exclusionists)	0.039*** (0.006)	0.037*** (0.006)	0.040*** (0.006)	0.040*** (0.006)	0.039*** (0.006)	0.041*** (0.009)	1.917*** (0.153)	0.022*** (0.005)
	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES	YES YES
Constant	-0.150** (0.050)	-0.124** (0.044)	-0.177*** (0.051)	-0.221*** (0.056)	-0.149** (0.052)	-0.189 (0.121)	0.000*** (0.000)	-0.087* (0.035)
Observations	127409	121756	127409	127409	127409	43293	100795	127409
R ²	0.117	0.075	0.113	0.110	0.116	0.058		0.055
Pseudo R							0.157	
AIC	-4700.88	-20525.1	-4100.79	-3635.67	-4586.42	-8018.82	50185.4	-66514.5
BIC	-4515.53	-20340.6	-3915.44	-3450.32	-4401.07	-7853.98	50537.7	-66329.1

Note: Standard errors in parentheses; * p < 0.05, ** p < 0.01, *** p < 0.001

Table A7. Fixed-Effects Models with varying sample restrictions (RC3)

	Min 1 Resp.	Min 10 Resp.	Min 20 Resp.	Min 30 Resp.	Min 40 Resp.	Min 50 Resp.	Min 60 Resp.	Min 70 Resp.	Min 80 Resp.	Min 90 Resp.	Min 100 Resp.
Political Elite Discourse	0.035*** (0.009)	0.035*** (0.010)	0.034*** (0.010)	0.031*** (0.009)	0.030** (0.009)	0.028** (0.009)	0.028** (0.009)	0.027** (0.009)	0.025* (0.011)	0.019 (0.010)	0.021 (0.011)
National Identity (Exclusionists)	0.057*** (0.008)	0.059*** (0.008)	0.060*** (0.008)	0.063*** (0.008)	0.065*** (0.008)	0.067*** (0.008)	0.068*** (0.009)	0.070*** (0.009)	0.072*** (0.009)	0.075*** (0.010)	0.077*** (0.010)
Constant	-0.187* (0.072)	-0.205* (0.078)	-0.237** (0.084)	-0.287** (0.104)	-0.282* (0.106)	-0.368** (0.132)	-0.359* (0.134)	-0.357** (0.132)	-0.370 (0.207)	-0.327 (0.243)	-0.304 (0.260)
Observations	85916	81438	78454	74100	68748	66291	63082	61058	54959	49618	45919
R ²	0.094	0.090	0.088	0.087	0.084	0.083	0.080	0.080	0.080	0.083	0.082
AIC	29759.5	32219.2	33602.4	34828.8	36068.2	36391.6	36752.9	36627.5	35787.1	34139.4	33144
BIC	29937.3	32396	33778.6	35003.9	36241.8	36564.5	36924.9	36798.9	35956.5	34306.8	33310

Standard errors in parentheses; * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$ **Table A8.** Interaction effect models with varying sample restrictions (RC3)

	Min 1 Resp.	Min 10 Resp.	Min 20 Resp.	Min 30 Resp.	Min 40 Resp.	Min 50 Resp.	Min 60 Resp.	Min 70 Resp.	Min 80 Resp.	Min 90 Resp.	Min 100 Resp.
Political Elite Discourse	0.018 (0.034)	0.015 (0.048)	0.021 (0.050)	0.015 (0.054)	0.014 (0.054)	0.001 (0.059)	0.002 (0.059)	-0.123 (0.073)	-0.113 (0.112)	-0.200*** (0.040)	-0.205*** (0.039)
National Identity (Exclusionists)	0.026 (0.019)	0.026 (0.020)	0.025 (0.021)	0.025 (0.021)	0.024 (0.021)	0.024 (0.021)	0.024 (0.021)	0.025 (0.026)	0.026 (0.026)	0.043 (0.024)	0.042 (0.024)
Interaction National Identity x Political elite discourse	0.023*** (0.006)	0.023*** (0.006)	0.021*** (0.006)	0.022*** (0.005)	0.022*** (0.005)	0.022*** (0.005)	0.022*** (0.005)	0.022*** (0.005)	0.021*** (0.005)	0.023** (0.007)	0.024** (0.007)
Constant	-0.223* (0.099)	-0.258* (0.107)	-0.270* (0.110)	-0.336** (0.124)	-0.340** (0.124)	-0.417* (0.161)	-0.419* (0.161)	-0.506*** (0.138)	-0.480 (0.279)	-0.403** (0.143)	-0.415** (0.143)
Observations	84301	79823	76839	72485	67133	64676	61991	59967	52710	47369	44547
R ²	0.106	0.102	0.099	0.098	0.094	0.092	0.091	0.091	0.092	0.097	0.097
AIC	29141	31594.3	32998	34272	35539.6	35883.6	35911.2	35742	34044	32335.4	31528
BIC	29720.3	32132.9	33506.8	34740.8	35977.1	36301.1	36317.8	36120.1	34381.1	32624.6	31789.1

Standard errors in parentheses; * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$